

## REVIEW

by Prof. Dr. Nelly Andreeva Bencheva  
of a dissertation for awarding the educational and scientific degree "doctor"  
by: field of higher education 3. Social, economic and legal sciences  
professional direction 3.7 Administration and management

**Author:** Gulban Turmakhanovna Dosberdieva

**Topic:** Methodologies for increasing management efficiency in dental clinics of Kazakhstan

**Research supervisor:** 1. Prof Dr Spicha Inessa

2. Prof. Dr. Atanas Lyondev/ Проф д-р Атанас ЛЬОНДЕВ/

### 1. Brief biographical data for the PhD student

During the period 2014-2015, PhD student Gulban Dosberdieva completed a master's degree (6M-110200) in "Public Health" at the Kazakh Medical University for Continuing Education. During the period 1991-1996, he graduated from the State Medical Institute in Almaty, Faculty of Dentistry. Specialty "Dentistry". He has extensive practice as a dentist. In 1996, he started working at the Kazakh State Medical Institute in a printing office as a machinist. In 2004, she was appointed as a senior laboratory assistant at the Department of Orthopedic Dentistry of the Kazakh State Medical University. Since 2015, he has held the position of "assistant" in the Department of "Dentistry" of the Kazakh National Medical University "Asfendiyarov".

Her professional status is "Doctor of the highest category". Has good computer skills. Native language is Kazakh. She speaks Russian and basic English.

For good work, she was awarded with state awards - Medal "Excellence in Health Care" of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Medal "For Contribution to the Development of Health Care" of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The main highlights presented on the biographical data of the PhD student Gulban Dosberdieva in relation to the procedure, unequivocally show her good theoretical and practical training in a medical business environment, which contributed to the quality of the research process in the course of developing the dissertation work.

### 2. Relevance of the topic and appropriateness of the set goals and tasks

The dissertation examines a current topic related to dentistry as a medical activity, which is becoming more and more widespread in Kazakhstan due to an increase in dental diseases. Today, Kazakhstan is witnessing an increase in the number of dental organizations, which also leads to intensifying competition. The quality of dental services in the private sector is constantly increasing due to the use of newer and more efficient technologies of work and treatment.

Dental clinics are faced with the need to increase management efficiency and attract and retain more clients. This especially applies to state dental clinics, which in Kazakhstan are 10%.

In this context, the selected topic deals with important and current aspects of increasing the efficiency of management and research of the factors affecting the more effective management of dental clinics in the conditions of Kazakhstan.

I believe that the PhD student very skillfully, with solid objective arguments, achieving the goal and specific tasks of the dissertation research, justified the relevance of the chosen topic.

## **2. Knowing the problem**

The dissertation was developed in a volume of 203 pages. In terms of structure and content, a good and logical presentation of the material has been achieved. The work is structured as follows: introduction, four chapters, conclusion, conclusions, practical recommendations, bibliography and an appendix. 211 literary titles were used, including 79 titles in English. The results of the empirical research are illustrated in the main text of the dissertation in 30 tables, 23 figures.

The PhD student shows a good knowledge of the literature and the theoretical foundations of management effectiveness considered in the light of modern management. The doctoral student handles the category and conceptual apparatus of management well in the process of developing the theoretical analysis and presenting the results of the empirical research. A good impression is also made by the practice of defining basic terms that are widely used in the dissertation, such as benchmarking, management, organizational culture, business management law, etc. The ability to clearly and precisely present the opinions of individual authors and to take one's own reasoned position is shown.

The formulated clear research thesis that the management models used in dental clinics are not always effective. They are influenced by many factors - organizational, legal, social, economic, technological, etc. The object and subject of the research are clearly formulated.

The purpose of the dissertation work is specifically defined, namely the development of a methodology for improving the management in state dental clinics, which will facilitate the access, quality and safety of dental care.

To achieve the goal, five research tasks were solved.

The realization of the goals and tasks of the research, as well as proving the hypothesis, is achieved through a specially developed methodology.

The dissertation contains specific results and empirical evidence that objectively reflect the real achievements of the conducted scientific research on increasing the efficiency of management in state dental clinics. The main contributions in the dissertation are related to the study of the

management process and analysis of the existing problems in providing quality dental services and building a management improvement model in state dental clinics.

The achieved results show that the doctoral student has a good theoretical preparation, solid practical knowledge and skills, which allowed her to independently conduct the scientific research that meets the requirements for the preparation of a research paper for the acquisition of the PhD.

## **5. Research methodology**

The conducted research is based on a specially developed and tested methodology in accordance with the object, the subject, the goal, the tasks and the hypothesis. The methodology and methodology of the empirical research are described in detail in the second chapter. The organization of the research process and the selected methodological toolkit are the result of using a wide information base, including: information arrays of the state dental clinics of Almaty, development strategy of Kazakhstan 2030-2050, a series of decrees, regulations, rules, materials of the Ministry of Agriculture of the Republic of Kazakhstan, related to the approval of methods for the transformation of state health care organizations, approval of rules for the development of methods for the formation of labor remuneration and planning of costs for medical services, approval of the nomenclature of medical positions and specialties in the health care system, an ordinance to amend the qualification characteristics of the positions of healthcare workers, empirical material obtained from a survey of employees of the system of state dental clinics in Kazakhstan. For the needs of the literature review, the Cochrane Library, MEDLINE, PubMed, EMBASE databases were used.

Statistical data processing was performed using the SPSS statistical software package. The analysis of the obtained results was carried out with the application of the following main methods: analysis and comparison, content analysis, bibliographic, sociological methods (focus group method, survey method), statistical methods, the method of system analysis and approach, process approach, SWOT analysis.

It can be summarized that the research technology is based on a developed research program including the use of modern quantitative and qualitative methods, which allow in the analysis process to provide more reliable results and management efficiency assessments.

## **6. Characterization and evaluation of the dissertation work**

In the first chapter of the dissertation, a comprehensive review of management theories of medical institutions is made. In a historical aspect, an analysis of the existing schools of management was made, summarizing their main contributions to the development of management. With the help

of the bibliographic method and elements of content analysis, a deep theoretical analysis of the researched topic was carried out.

The global and local experience in assessing the quality of management of medical organizations was studied. An analysis of the mechanisms for increasing the efficiency of medical organizations in modern conditions was carried out. An analysis and evaluation of the experience in the country regarding mechanisms for increasing operational efficiency was made.

In the fourth section of the first chapter, methodical approaches for evaluating the effectiveness of management of the medical organization are thoroughly analyzed. The doctoral student asserts her own view that in healthcare, basic categories such as "user relationship system, process approach, stakeholders, social responsibility, information security" are still not sufficiently adequately adopted. According to her, in order to promote new management technologies, it is necessary for the manager and the staff to adopt a quality philosophy. To assess the quality of management of a medical organization, it is proposed to use the model for diagnostic self-assessment of the company's management system - model of functional assessment of management (MFA). In this context, significant questions are raised about the structure of the functional model, which is represented by basic criteria reflecting the functions of management: forecasting/planning, organization, motivation, control, coordination and communication. Particular attention is paid to the evaluation of the quality of management by performing internal audits, corresponding to ISO 9001. To analyze and evaluate the activities of the medical organization, the use of the McKinsey 7C model is also recommended. but made their own interpretations and conclusions.

Emphasis is placed on one of the modern mechanisms for achieving efficiency and quality of medical services. In this regard, the methodology for business planning is revealed, which consists of developing a strategy for the development of a medical organization. and study the feasibility of its activities. In this connection, the diversity of using specific tools to satisfy these needs is revealed. Spatial attention is given to management research in assessing the effectiveness of the management system of any organization using the business improvement model (Excellence Model) developed by the European Foundation for Quality Management EFQM (European Foundation for Quality) . This model is based on the philosophy of TQM (Total Quality Management) and a systematic approach to management that takes into account the interests of all stakeholders in the organization and is considered by managers as a tool for evaluating the level of development of their organizations compared to the reference level.

As a summary, the in-depth theoretical analysis of the evaluation of the effectiveness of the management system in the medical organization is a guarantee for the successful development of the second and third chapters of the dissertation work.

The second chapter is devoted to the methodology and methodology of the empirical research. Four methodological tasks are clearly and precisely defined, the implementation of which is the basis of the research program developed in detail. The second stage of the research includes an overview of the real situation of the studied problem in Kazakhstan. The quality of management of a state dental organization was assessed using a sociological survey of managers (chief physicians, deputy chief physicians, heads of departments, chief and senior nurses, chief accountants), as well as doctors and nurses.

The level of management competencies among managers of dental organizations was assessed. 36 managers at different levels - from chief doctors to heads of services - participated in the study.

Based on the developed research program, the doctoral student successfully applies it in the third chapter, dedicated to the analysis of the management system in state stomatology organizations. An assessment of the functional management model in state dental clinics was made. The factors affecting the quality of management of state dental organizations have been revealed and analyzed. The level of satisfaction of the population with the quality of dental care in state dental organizations was established as an indicator of the quality of management.

The fourth chapter is devoted to the overall methodology for improving the quality and efficiency of management in state dental organizations. Dentists' and nurses' satisfaction with working conditions has been identified as a factor in management effectiveness. The management competencies of the heads of dental organizations were also evaluated. Indicators of management effectiveness in state dental organizations have been developed.

As a summary, we can point out that the dissertation contains specific results and empirical evidence that objectively reflect the credibility of the material on which the contributions of the dissertation work and the real achievements of the conducted scientific research are formulated.

## **7. Contributions and significance of the development for science and practice**

The following more important scientific contributions can be noted in the presented dissertation work:

1. On the basis of a deep critical analysis of modern theories and practice of management, the peculiarities and new aspects of management for dental clinics and their influence on its effectiveness, considering the conditions of the Republic of Kazakhstan, are revealed.

2. A definition of technology was developed to improve the management process in dental clinics, which includes: analysis, planning, coordination, motivation and control of resources in order to meet the needs of dental services.

3. A methodological and original methodical approach was developed, including models, indicators, factors having a key influence on improving the efficiency of the management process in state dental clinics.

4. On the basis of theoretical justifications and proven empirical results from the application of the research methodology, a system for evaluating the management models in the state dental clinics has been developed.

5. The management model in dental clinics has been modified.

Among the scientific contributions with practical application, we will indicate the following:

1. The developed methodology for increasing efficiency in state dental clinics can be used by managers to formulate key management decisions for effective management and improvement of the quality of dental services.

2. Specific recommendations have been formulated for preparing a management strategy and increasing its effectiveness.

3. Monitoring of management performance indicators ensures the sustainability of the management system and helps to improve the performance indicators of the organization.

## **8. Evaluation of publications on the dissertation work**

A list of publications is presented in connection with the dissertation- a total of 13. Of these, 8 / eight / scientific articles and 5 / five / reports. I accept only the scientific stages for review. Three scientific articles are self -published = two articles are in Russian and one in English. Five scientific articles are co -authored. Three of them are published in Russian and two in English. The total number of points of scientific publications is 49, 16, covering the minimum national requirements for the acquisition of the PhD in the PD 3.7 Administration and management, thirty points.

## **9. Personal participation of the PhD student**

The PhD student independently develops the purpose, tasks, program and methodology of the research. An analytical review of local and foreign scientific publications and regulations on the problem under consideration was carried out. The collection and analysis of the research materials, their statistical processing and the formulation of conclusions and proposals are entirely the independent work of the PhD student.

## **10. Abstract**

The abstract correctly and accurately reflects the structure and content of the dissertation work.

It includes the main chapters, results of the research done, conclusions, conclusion, contributions and bibliography.

### **11. Critical remarks and recommendations**

A very good approach is the summaries and conclusions after each chapter. They could be even more complete and specific if some of the research results indicated in the appendices were presented in the main text. In this way, arguments and evidence with the specific results of one's own research strengthen the defense of the thesis and hypothesis.

### **12. Recommendations for future use of dissertation contributions and results**

I recommend the doctoral student to publish the results of the dissertation work in prestigious scientific journals with an impact factor in English.

### **CONCLUSION**

Bearing in mind the scientific merits and scientific-applied contributions of the dissertation work, I give a positive assessment to the scientific work presented for public defense.

I propose to the scientific jury to award **Gulban Turmakhanovna Dosberdieva** the educational and scientific degree "**doctor**" in: 3. Social, economic and legal sciences; professional direction: 3.7 Administration and management.

29.10.2024г.

Reviwer:  
/ Prof PhD Nelly Bencheva /