

ACADEMIC REVIEW

by Prof. Dr. Toni Bogdanova Mihova,
Professional field: 3.7 Administration and Management
Industrial Management Department
Technical University of Sofia, Plovdiv branch

Regarding: competition for obtaining the academic position PhD in:

Field of higher education: 3. Social, economic, and legal sciences
Professional field: 3.7 Administration and Management
Doctoral Program: Organization and Management out of the Sphere of Material
Production (Public Administration)

Author: **Gulbanu Turmakhanova Dosberdieva**
Dissertation topic: **Methodology for increasing management efficiency in the
dental clinics of Kazakhstan**

Plovdiv

2024

1. Relevance and significance of the developed scientific problem

The issues regarding the efficient dental clinics management are becoming increasingly important in connection with the increase in dental diseases of the population in Kazakhstan. This contributes to the necessary business environment for better dental clinics management.

According to the author's information, less than 10% of the dental clinics in Kazakhstan are government owned, providing free medical care to socially disadvantaged people. The dental clinics operate in conditions of increasing competition from the private dental sector, due to modern equipment and efficient technologies. These conditions give rise to the need to analyze the existing problems in order to provide quality services, as well as to search for opportunities to improve the management of public dental clinics.

This is what arouses the author's scientific interest. The extensive professional experience of Gulbanu Dosberdiyeva as a dentist, as well as her scientific and research activities in the field of dentistry, are of great importance for the fulfillment of the set goal and solving tasks.

In this regard, I believe that the development of a methodology for increasing the management efficiency in dental clinics in Kazakhstan is a topical task in a theoretical and scientifically applied aspect.

2. Characterization and assessment of the dissertation

The dissertation contains: introduction, four chapters, conclusions, practical recommendations, bibliography, and one appendix and has a length of 203 pages. The structure corresponds to the purpose and the tasks set to be solved. The bibliography contains 211 sources, including 79 in foreign languages in the field of management of medical services. A number of modern scientific articles related to the efficiency and quality of healthcare in different countries, as well as trends in the development of dental services, are used. The research results are illustrated with 23 figures and 30 tables.

The following methods were used: analysis and comparison, content analysis, bibliographic, sociological methods (focus group method, survey method), statistical methods, system analysis method and approach, process approach, SWOT analysis.

The chosen research methodology allows the realization of the set aims and objectives in the dissertation.

In the first chapter, which consists of four sections, the theoretical foundations of the management of medical organizations are revealed. A historical review of the theoretical concepts development which are the basis of the concepts of health management, is made.

A historical overview of the theoretical concept development underlying health care management concepts is provided. Based on a literature review, the characteristics of foreign healthcare management practices are indicated. The specificity of the medical organization's management resulting from the peculiarities of the medical service is explained.

The PhD student examines a number of statements by various authors proving the higher efficiency of private dental clinics compared to public ones. The doctoral student manages to defend the relevance of the need to improve the management in public dental clinics. Following the logic of the work, the emphasis in the third section of the first chapter is on the management mechanisms for increasing the activity efficiency in medical organizations in modern conditions. Positions of various authors regarding the medical service quality criteria were considered. Some of them are accessibility, timeliness, adequacy, efficiency, safety, etc.

The practice of European countries is specified in the dissertation. The eight principles on which this practice is built are orientation to the result of the activity, leadership, continuous development with the participation of the staff, satisfaction of the users of the medical service, improvement and innovation, process management, development of partnership with other organizations, corporate social responsibility.

The LEAN methodology as a factor for increasing the efficiency of management in public dental clinics is also explained.

Significant for the dissertation research are the studies indicated by the author concerning the evaluation of the management system efficiency of any organization using the business improvement model (Excellence Model) developed by the European Foundation for Quality Management (EFQM). The model is based on the

philosophy of TQM (Total Quality Management) and considers the interests of all stakeholders in the organization.

The theoretical chapter ends with the formulation of six conclusions.

The second chapter contains the methodology and methods of dissertation research. Four stages of the study are conditionally defined:

1. Analysis of theoretical concepts and views on the problem under study.
2. Analysis of the real situation on the problem under study.
3. Determination of the factors influencing the efficient management of public dental clinics.
4. Development of methodological approaches for evaluating the management system and guidelines for improving its efficiency in public dental clinics.

In the analysis of the real situation in Kazakhstan, the management quality of the dental public health organization was evaluated by means of a sociological survey of managers (chief physicians, deputy chief physicians, department heads, chief and senior nurses, chief accountants), as well as doctors and nurses. An assessment of the level of management competencies among the managers of dental organizations was also made. The study involved 36 managers at different levels – from chief physicians to department heads.

The third chapter contains an analysis of the management system in public dental clinics in Kazakhstan, with an evaluation of the functional management model. A map for evaluating this model was developed, based on the responses of the managers of the studied clinics. The problem areas are in the management functions of organization, motivation and control. Unlike managers, specialists working in dental clinics rate control, planning and motivation functions with lower ratings. The author's explanation of the difference in answers is related to insufficient coordination in management. This chapter analyzes the factors that affect the quality of management of public dental clinics. As an indicator of the management efficiency of public dental clinics, a survey of the population's satisfaction with the quality of dental care in them was conducted.

The fourth chapter includes the methodology for improving the management quality and efficiency in public dental clinics. A sociological survey was conducted with 150 dentists and 120 nurses, regarding the study of their satisfaction with working conditions, pay, organizational culture, and workplace microclimate, as factors for management efficiency. An assessment of the management competencies of the dental clinics managers was made. Specific guidelines for the effective functioning of public dental clinics is formulated.

To conclude this section, I summarize that the dissertation work is structured according to the set aims and objectives of the research. I appreciate the doctoral student's theoretical preparation and her research abilities, on the basis of which she formulates concrete proposals of a practical nature.

3. Scientific and practical contributions and significance of the dissertation work

The scientific results achieved are largely due to the knowledge and experience acquired by the author in the management of dental clinics. Two groups of scientific contributions that reflect the achievements of Gulbanu Dosberdieva can be indicated: scientific and scientific applied.

Scientific contributions of the dissertation:

- systematization and further development of the theoretical positions for management of dental clinics, adapted to the conditions in Kazakhstan;
- defining a technology for improving the management process in dental clinics, including analysis, planning, coordination, motivation and control of resources in order to meet the needs of dental services;
- developing a system for evaluating management models in public dental clinics.

Scientific and applied contributions:

- developed methodology to increase efficiency in public dental clinics aimed at improving the quality of dental services.

- formulated specific guidelines for increasing the efficiency of management in public dental clinics.

4. Assessment of dissertation publications

The PhD student presents 13 publications on the topic of the dissertation: 5 of them are independent and 8 are co-authored. Eight of the publications are scientific articles and 5 are reports from international scientific conferences. In volume and quality, they correspond to the requirements for obtaining the scientific degree "doctor".

5. Autoabstract

The autoabstract is developed in accordance with the requirements for its preparation and contains the main results and contributions of the dissertation work. It is 28 pages long and includes the aims and objectives of the research, the highlights of the individual chapters of the dissertation, as well as the contributions of the author.

6. Critical remarks and recommendations

The dissertation is a completed comprehensive study of the management efficiency in the dental clinics of Kazakhstan with a fulfilled goal and solved tasks, containing contributing results.

My recommendation is to use more modern literature sources in the field of management, including dental clinics. The reasons for the mentioned problems in the management of the public dental clinics could be analyzed in more depth, as well as the new trends in the management mechanisms to increase its efficiency could be indicated.

I recommend the candidate to promote scientific results in the future through publications in journals, refereed and indexed in world-famous databases with scientific information (Scopus / Web of Science).

Question:

1. At what stage is the digitization of the work process in the dental practice in Kazakhstan?

CONCLUSION

The dissertation of Gulbanu Turmakhanova Dosberdieva, proposed for defense, is in accordance with the norms of the Law on the Development of the Academic Staff in the Republic of Bulgaria (DASRBA), the Regulations for its Implementation and the Regulations of the Higher School of Security and Economics (HSSE).

Considering the achieved scientific and scientific-applied results in the dissertation work and the research abilities of the doctoral student, I give **a positive assessment** of the dissertation work on the topic Methodology for increasing management efficiency in the dental clinics of Kazakhstan.

I propose to the esteemed scientific jury to award the educational and scientific degree Doctor to Gulbanu Turmakhanova Dosberdiyeva in the field of higher education: 3. Social, economic and legal sciences, professional field 3.7 Administration and Management.

**Plovdiv:
30.10. 2024**

**REVIEWER:
/ Prof. Dr. Toni Mihova /**

